

This site uses cookies. [More info](#)



[Home](#) / [Archive](#) / [Volume 7, Issue 9](#)

« Responses

Article menu



Obstetrics and gynaecology
Research

PDF

Uterine balloon tamponade as an adjunct to misoprostol for the treatment of uncontrolled postpartum haemorrhage: a randomised controlled trial in Benin and Mali

[Compose a Response to This Article](#) +

Other responses

Jump to comment:

Critical analysis of the Dumont et al. uterine balloon randomized controlled trial in Benin and Mali

Thomas F. Burke

Published on: 15 October 2017

Published on: 15 October 2017

Critical analysis of the Dumont et al. uterine balloon randomized controlled trial in Benin and Mali

Thomas F. Burke, Physician and Professor Massachusetts General Hospital and Harvard University

As postpartum hemorrhage (PPH) researchers, and leaders in education and care of maternal health emergencies, from the United States, UK, Canada, India, Peru, Honduras, Zambia, India, Kenya, Tanzania, Colombia and Nepal, we read the Dumont et al paper with great interest. We would like to share our review:

The most fundamental flaw of this paper is that the authors confuse an intention-to-treat study of a clinical pathway of interventions and behaviors, with the efficacy of a device. These are two very different research questions. In order to test the latter via a randomized controlled trial (RCT) the two groups would

PDF

Help

need to be the similar and subjects that did not even receive the device (or received it in desperation two hours after the diagnosis of uncontrolled PPH) certainly could not be included in the intervention group. Thus, this study attempts to test intention-to-treat, not the efficacy of the uterine balloon tamponade (UBT) device.

The second most obvious flaw is that degrees of illness are not accounted for. Clinically defined "uncontrolled PPH" is in no way a homogeneous group. For example, someone that has been referred in and is moribund from their advanced shock is an entirely different subject than someone who has mild uncontrolled PPH. Since this is not controlled for, these two groups are likely incomparable.

Even taking into account the two issues described above, the two groups are different and heavily favor the non-intervention group. For example, in the intervention group the following were considerably worse than in the non-intervention group: late uterotonics (54% vs 37%) and retained products of conception/placenta (19% vs 10%). Additionally, UBTs were placed more than 30 minutes after diagnosis of uncontrolled PPH in 58% of cases

Therefore, while this study truly does not test the UBT device, what it does do is tell us that the care providers were not able to provide quality care to women defined as having uncontrolled PPH, despite being within the framework of a study that encouraged best practice. This is indeed extremely important. This study adds to the growing literature describing that performance of health care providers may often be inconsistent and suboptimal in maternal health emergencies, and, that these poor practices may contribute to the flawed nature of RCTs in maternal health interventions.

Prof Burke, Prof Arulkumaran, Prof. Rogo, Dr. Manasyn, Susana Ku, RMW, Monica Oguttu, RNMW, Dr. Thapa, Prof Ochoa, Prof. Tarimo, Dr. Eckardt, Dr. Suarez and Dr. Garg,

Show Less

Conflict of Interest:

None declared.

[Back to top](#)

PDF

Help



Consultant Geriatrician

Chertsey, Surrey |

This is an exciting opportunity to join a dynamic and ambitious Senior Medical Adult Services (SAMS) Team at St Peter's Hospital

Recruiter: Ashford and St Peters Hospital NHS Trust

[Apply for this job](#)

GP Opportunities

St Helens, Merseyside |

We are looking to expand our GP Clinician base by not only looking to attract 'traditional' GPs but also proactively encouraging portfolio careers.

Recruiter: St Helens CCG

[Apply for this job](#)

Consultant Post in Developmental Paediatrics

Liverpool, Merseyside |

You will be joining the Trust at an exciting time as we have moved into our new purpose built state of the art Children's Health Park

Recruiter: Alder Hey Children's NHS Foundation Trust

[Apply for this job](#)

Consultant in Paediatric Anaesthesia with a Cardiac Interest

Other content recommended for you

[A qualitative assessment of the impact of a uterine balloon tamponade package on decisions regarding the role of emergency hysterectomy in women with uncontrolled postpartum haemorrhage in Kenya and Senegal](#)

Anna Alaska Pendleton et al., BMJ Open

[Postpartum bleeding is reduced with sublingual powdered misoprostol when compared with oxytocin injection, but a new formulation of misoprostol is unlikely to revolutionise postpartum haemorrhage care.](#)

Beverly Winikoff et al., Evid Based Med

[PL.06 Treatment for Primary Postpartum Haemorrhage – A Cochrane Systematic Review](#)

Z Alfirevic et al., Arch Dis Child

[Intrauterine tamponade balloon use in the treatment of uterine inversion.](#)

Sina Haeri et al., BMJ Case Rep

PDF

Help

[Oxytocin during labour and risk of severe postpartum haemorrhage: a population-based, cohort-nested case-control study](#)

Jérémie Belghiti et al., *BMJ Open*

[Condom-catheter tamponade for the treatment of postpartum haemorrhage and factors associated with success: A prospective observational study](#)

MDLinx

CONTENT

[Latest Content](#)

[Archive](#)

[Browse by topic](#)

[Most read articles](#)

[Responses](#)

JOURNAL

[About](#)

[Editorial board](#)

[Thank you to our reviewers](#)

[Sign up for email alerts](#)

AUTHORS

[Instructions for authors](#)

[Submit a paper](#)

[Editorial policies](#)

[Open Access at BMJ](#)

[Instructions for reviewers](#)

[BMJ Author Hub](#)

HELP

PDF

Help

[Contact us](#)

[Reprints](#)

[Permissions](#)

[Advertising](#)

[Feedback form](#)



[Website Terms & Conditions](#)

[Privacy & Cookies](#)

[Contact BMJ](#)

Online: ISSN 2044-6055 Print: ISSN 2044-6055

Copyright © 2018 by the BMJ Publishing Group Ltd. All rights reserved.

京ICP备15042040号-3

Evidence-Based Mental Health  Time-saving, distilled research information for mental health professionals

  **BMJ** [Learn more today ▶](#)

